

University of Groningen

## The role of the phonological loop in sentence comprehension

Withaar, R.G

**IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.**

*Document Version*

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Publication date:*

2002

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Withaar, R. G. (2002). *The role of the phonological loop in sentence comprehension*. s.n.

### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

### Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

*Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.*

# The Role of the Phonological Loop in Sentence Comprehension

Rienk Withaar



The research reported in this thesis was carried out under auspices of the School of Behavioral and Cognitive Neurosciences (BCN) and the University of Groningen

Copyright © 2002 by Rienk Withaar  
Printed by Print Partners Ipskamp, Enschede

Groningen Dissertations in Linguistics (GRODIL), # 40  
ISSN 0928-0030



Rijks*universiteit* Groningen

# The Role of the Phonological Loop in Sentence Comprehension

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de  
Letteren  
aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen  
op gezag van de  
Rector Magnificus, dr. D.F.J. Bosscher,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen op  
maandag 24 juni 2002  
om 14:15 uur

door

Rienk Gerwin Withaar

geboren op 14 mei 1971  
te Joure

Promotor: Prof. dr. J. Koster

Co-promotor: Dr. L.A. Stowe

Beoordelingscommissie: Prof. dr. Y.R.M. Bastiaanse,  
Prof. dr. J. Nerbonne en  
Prof. dr. D. Swinney

# Contents

Contents.....	i
Acknowledgments.....	v
Chapter 1 Introductory Remarks .....	1
Introduction .....	1
Assuming a Role for (Phonological) WM in Sentence Comprehension.....	2
<i>Defining the Role of WM in Sentence Comprehension.....</i>	3
<i>Position of the Current Research .....</i>	3
<i>A Limited Role for Phonological WM in Sentence Comprehension? .....</i>	4
<i>Reconsidering the Role of Phonological WM in Sentence Comprehension .....</i>	6
A Quick Walk-Through.....	6
<i>The Basis for the Current Research .....</i>	6
<i>Replication and Revision.....</i>	7
<i>The Influence of Reversibility.....</i>	8
<i>Investigating the Checking Hypothesis .....</i>	8
A Reader's Guide to This Book .....	8
Chapter 2 Background and Goals.....	10
Introduction .....	10
The Sentence Comprehension Literature.....	10
<i>An Early WM Approach to Sentence Comprehension.....</i>	11
<i>About the Syntax-First Approach and WM Limitations.....</i>	12
<i>The Berwick &amp; Weinberg Parsing Model.....</i>	15
<i>The Syntactic Prediction Locality Theory .....</i>	17
Methodological Interlude .....	18
<i>Sternberg's Interaction Logic .....</i>	18
<i>The Logic of Double Dissociations .....</i>	19
Baddeley's WM Model .....	20
<i>Visual vs. Verbal WM.....</i>	20
<i>Partitioning the Phonological Loop: Phonological Storage vs. Articulatory Rehearsal .....</i>	21
<i>Central-Executive Processing .....</i>	24
Attempts to Apply Baddeley's WM Model to Sentence Processing .....	24
<i>The Single-Resource Theory .....</i>	24
<i>The Separate Language Interpretation Resource Hypothesis .....</i>	25
<i>A Multiple Component View.....</i>	26
<i>Predictions of the Three Theories .....</i>	27
Goals of the Current Research.....	28
<i>An Evaluation of the SLIR Hypothesis .....</i>	28
<i>The Importance of Cross-Linguistic Replication.....</i>	30

<i>A New Role for Phonological Memory</i> .....	31
<b>Chapter 3 About the Role of the Phonological Loop in Syntactic Analysis</b> .....	32
Introduction .....	32
<i>Sternberg's Interaction Logic</i> .....	33
<i>Baddeley's WM Model</i> .....	33
<i>A Single-Resource Theory of Sentence Processing</i> .....	34
<i>The Syntactic Prediction Locality Theory</i> .....	35
<i>The Separate Language Interpretation Resource Theory</i> .....	36
<i>Re-examining Evidence for Separate Resources</i> .....	39
Experiment 1 .....	42
<i>Introduction</i> .....	42
<i>Method</i> .....	46
<i>Results</i> .....	50
<i>Discussion</i> .....	52
Experiment 2 .....	56
<i>Introduction</i> .....	56
<i>Method</i> .....	56
<i>Results</i> .....	59
<i>Discussion</i> .....	61
General Discussion.....	63
<i>The Single vs. Separate Resource Issue</i> .....	63
<i>About the Nature of the Phonological Back-Up Representation</i> .....	64
<i>Toward a New Model of WM and Sentence Comprehension</i> .....	65
<b>Chapter 4 Reversibility and the Use of the Phonological Loop</b> .....	70
Introduction .....	70
<i>Outline</i> .....	70
<i>A Separate-Resource Model</i> .....	71
<i>Shortcomings of the Separate-Resource Theory</i> .....	72
<i>Evidence for Separate Resources Reconsidered</i> .....	74
<i>Reconsiderations Reconsidered</i> .....	76
Experiment 3 .....	79
<i>Introduction</i> .....	79
<i>Method</i> .....	79
<i>Results</i> .....	83
<i>Discussion</i> .....	86
Experiment 4 .....	87
<i>Introduction</i> .....	87
<i>Method</i> .....	87
<i>Results</i> .....	91
<i>Discussion</i> .....	92
General Discussion.....	94
<i>Consequences for the WM Resource Debate</i> .....	94
<i>The Use of the Phonological Loop in Syntactic Processing</i> .....	95
<b>Chapter 5 The Phonological Loop and Integration of Adjectives</b> .....	99
Introduction .....	99
<i>A Two-Stage Model of WM and Sentence Comprehension</i> .....	99
<i>The Role of a Phonological Back-Up in Syntactic Processing</i> .....	100
<i>The Suppression Task, Subject-Verb Agreement, and <math>\Theta</math>-Role Assignment</i> .....	101

<i>The Influence of Articulatory Suppression on Integration in General</i> .....	102
<i>Adjective-Noun Agreement in Dutch</i> .....	105
<i>Summary</i> .....	105
Experiment 5a .....	106
<i>Method</i> .....	106
<i>Results</i> .....	109
<i>Discussion</i> .....	111
Experiment 5b .....	114
<i>Method</i> .....	114
<i>Results</i> .....	115
<i>Discussion</i> .....	116
General Discussion .....	118
<i>Evidence for a Utilitarian Deployment of the Phonological Back-Up</i> .....	118
<i>Separate WM Resources for Lexical Semantics?</i> .....	119
<i>Summary</i> .....	120
<b>Chapter 6 On the Predictive Power of Span Measures</b> .....	122
Introduction .....	122
<i>Outline</i> .....	123
<i>Correlation Analysis</i> .....	123
<i>An Overview of Span Measures</i> .....	125
<i>What do Language-Related Span Tasks Measure?</i> .....	127
<i>Span Data from Experiments 1 to 5b</i> .....	129
Collection of Span Data .....	130
<i>Nonword Span</i> .....	130
<i>Salthouse Listening Span Test</i> .....	131
Span Correlations in Experiments 1 to 5b .....	132
<i>Data Treatment</i> .....	132
<i>Correlations with Nonword and Salthouse Listening Span</i> .....	134
Discussion .....	136
<i>Explaining the Correlations</i> .....	136
<i>Consequences for the Debate on Span Measures</i> .....	138
<i>Some Remarks on the Use of Span Measures</i> .....	139
<b>Chapter 7 A Model of WM and Sentence Comprehension</b> .....	140
Introduction .....	140
Scope of the Model .....	140
The Model in a Nutshell .....	141
The Model's Components and Their Relations .....	142
<i>The Syntactic Processor</i> .....	142
<i>The Phonological Back-Up Representation</i> .....	143
<i>The Propositional Store</i> .....	144
Factors Contributing to Complexity Effects .....	144
Predictions of the Model .....	146
<i>Phonological-Loop Load</i> .....	146
<i>Manipulations Affected by Phonological-Loop Load</i> .....	147
<i>Manipulations Insensitive to Phonological-Loop Load</i> .....	150
<i>Reversibility</i> .....	151
Back to the Experimental Data .....	152
<i>Articulatory Suppression and the Phonological Back-Up</i> .....	152
<i>The Phonological Loop and Clause Type</i> .....	153



<i>The Phonological Loop and Embedding Type</i> .....	154
<i>The Phonological Loop and Adjectival Load</i> .....	156
<i>The Phonological Loop and Propositional Complexity</i> .....	156
<i>Summary</i> .....	156
Relating the Model to Language Pathology Data .....	157
<i>The Model and the Phonological Saliency Hypothesis of SLI</i> .....	157
<i>Evidence from Aphasia</i> .....	158
Open Issues and Suggestions for Future Research .....	159
<i>Storing the Back-Up: Articulatory Rehearsal or Phonological Storage?</i> .....	159
<i>Evidence for a Separate Semantic WM Component?</i> .....	161
<i>Interrupting the Adjective-Noun Agreement Relation</i> .....	162
Summary .....	163
References .....	164
Appendices .....	169
Materials: Experiment 1 .....	169
Materials: Experiment 2 .....	171
Materials: Experiment 3 .....	174
Materials: Experiment 4 .....	175
Materials: Experiment 5 .....	180
Span Data .....	185
<i>Span Data Normally Distributed</i> .....	185
<i>Correlations with Nonword Span</i> .....	187
<i>Correlations with Salthouse Listening Span</i> .....	189
Samenvatting.....	195